

**Procurement of Consultancy Services for
Rehabilitation and Restoration of 17MW Ranolia Hydropower Project, District Kohistan Lower, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.**

SUMMARY OF COMPARATIVE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL EVALUATION

Proposals, in the quality cum cost based selection shall finally be ranked according to their combined technical (S_T) and financial (S_F) scores using the weights:
(T- the weight given to the technical proposal, P = the weight given to the financial proposal, and T+P=1) indicated in the Data Sheet: $S = S_T * T\% + S_F * P\%$

| Sr. No | NAME OF FIRM / ASSOCIATION / JV | TECHNICAL EVALUATION | | | FINANCIAL EVALUATION | | | COMBINED | RANKING |
|--------|---|---|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---------|
| | | Technical Score Points/Marks/ Score (S _T) | Technical Wt. Factor (T%) | Technical Points/Marks/ Score | Financial Score Points/Marks/ Score (S _F) | Financial Wt. Factor (P%) | Financial Points/Marks/ Score | Total Evaluation Points / Marks/ Score(S) | |
| | | 1 | 2 | 3 = 1*2 | 4 | 5 | 6 = 4*5 | 7 = 3+6 | |
| 1 | (JV) Mountain Infrastructure & Engineering Services (MIES) Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm), M/s ILF Engineering Consultant (Member) & M/s HYMEC Engineering Consultants (Member) | 861.0 | 0.8 | 688.8 | 948.5 | 0.2 | 189.7 | 878.50 | 4 |
| 2 | (JV) M/s Electra Consultants (Lead member), M/s Technical, Engineering and Management Consultants, (TEAM) (JV member) & M/s Civ TECH Associates Consultant (JV member) | 891.5 | | 713.2 | 1000.0 | | 200.0 | 913.20 | 2 |
| 3 | (JV) BAK Consulting Engineers, University Town, Peshawar (Lead Firm) & Engineering General Consultants (EGC) Pvt Ltd, Lahore (JV Member) | 936.5 | | 749.2 | 839.3 | | 167.9 | 917.06 | 1 |
| 4 | (JV) Development and Management Consultants DMC Lahore Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm), Mirza Associates Engineering Services (MAES) Pvt Ltd (JV Member), & Barqaab Consulting Services Pvt Ltd (JV Member) | 832.7 | | 666.2 | 604.2 | | 120.8 | 786.99 | 7 |
| 5 | (JV) National Development Consultants (NDC) Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm), Power Aim Engineering Services (PAIM) Pvt Ltd (JV member), & Manzoor Ahmed Arbad Consultants (MAA) (Associate Member) | 861.0 | | 688.8 | 651.8 | | 130.4 | 819.17 | 6 |
| 6 | M/s Associated Consulting Engineers (ACE) Limited | 860.0 | | 688.0 | 667.8 | | 133.6 | 821.56 | 5 |
| 7 | (Association) Pakistan Engineering Services (PES) Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm) & Engineering & Technical Associates (ETA) Pvt Ltd (Associate Member) | 954.1 | | 763.3 | 604.6 | | 120.9 | 884.21 | 3 |

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE:

- (i) Prior to the notification of Grievance Redressal Committee (GRC), 6 Nos financial Bids were opened as per the approved technical evaluation by CEO, PEDO dated 06/06/2024. A Grievance Redressal Committee was constituted vide Notification No. 2054-06/PEDO/CEO/2024, dated July 19 2024, by the CEO, PEDO, upon grievances received from the bidders i.e. M/s Electra JV, M/s PES Association, and M/s MIES JV. The committee, after addressing the grievances, issued revised Technical scores/marks for the above-mentioned firms. The revised scores, other than increasing the total technical scores for the mentioned firms, resulted in qualification of Category-I (Firm's Experience) of M/s Electra JV. On the direction of CEO PEDO, the project director intimated to M/s Electra JV vide letter No. 707-11/PEDO/CE(M&E)/PD-RHPP, dated 10/09/2024, and their financial proposal was subsequently opened in the Procurement Committee meeting dated 11/09/2024 (MoM attached at Annex-J).
- (ii) Technical bid score for bidder at Sr. No.2 "(JV) M/s Electra Consultants (Lead member), M/s Technical, Engineering and Management Consultants, (TEAM) (JV member) & M/s Civ TECH Associates Consultant (JV member)" marks/score was revised from 856.2 to 891.5. Similarly, technical bid scores for bidder at Sr. No.1 "(JV) Mountain Infrastructure & Engineering Services (MIES) Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm), M/s ILF Engineering Consultant (Member) & M/s HYMEC Engineering Consultants (Member)" and bidder at Sr. No.7 "(Association) Pakistan Engineering Services (PES) Pvt Ltd (Lead Firm) & Engineering & Technical Associates (ETA) Pvt Ltd (Associate Member)" were revised from 827.9 and 900.1 to 861.0 and 954.1 respectively.
- (iii) The Procurement Committee unanimously recommends to the Executive Committee to approve the Combined Technical & Financial Evaluation Report for hiring of Consultancy Services for the Rehabilitation and Restoration of 17 MW Ranolia Hydropower Project (RHPP) and allow the Project Director, RHPP to issue the Letter of Acceptance (LOA), commence contract negotiations and signing of Contract Agreement with Ranked-1 bidder "(JV) BAK Consulting Engineers, University Town, Peshawar (Lead Firm) & Engineering General Consultants (EGC) Pvt Ltd, Lahore (JV Member)" for the evaluated bid price PKR 210,711,251/- (Two Hundred Ten Million, Seven Hundred Eleven Thousand, Two Hundred and Fifty-One only), which is inclusive of GST @ 2% of Salary Cost/Remuneration only (PKR 3,127,672/-) and Provisional Sum (PKR 20,000,000/-).
- (iv) An additional item "Travelling, Hotel Accommodation" has been proposed at Sr# 13 in Direct (Non-Salary) Cost of Consultants, i.e. Form Fin-5, of the bid, and additional 4.5 Man-Months (4 for Design & Construction and 0.5 for DLP) in addition with the 6 Man-Months specified in the RFP for Design & Construction only, in respect of proposed Structure Specialist, will be negotiated during Contract negotiations and clarifications will be sought from the bidder and as a result of the contract negotiations, appropriate adjustments in the contract price, if any, will be made accordingly.

Representative from (P&C), PEDO
(Committee Member)

Representative from (P&D) PEDO
(Committee Member)

Representative from Finance, PEDO
(Committee Member)

Ubaid Rahman
Deputy Director (Finance,
PEDO

Project Director (RHPP), PEDO
(Committee Chairman)